# OPINIONS AND DECLARATIONS RENDERED BY THE INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

Edited by

FRANCIS HEMMING, C.M.G., C.B.E. Secretary to the Commission

VOLUME 4. Part 2. Pp. 15-24

#### **OPINION 212**

Designation of the dates to be accepted as the dates of publication of the several volumes of Pallas (P.S.), Zoographia rosso-asiatica



#### LONDON:

Printed by Order of the International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature

and

Sold on behalf of the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature by the International Trust at its Publications Office 41, Queen's Gate, London, S.W.7

1954

Price Three Shillings and Ninepence

(All rights reserved)

# INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

#### COMPOSITION AT THE TIME OF THE ADOPTION OF THE **RULING GIVEN IN OPINION 212**

#### The Officers of the Commission

President: Dr. Karl Jordan, Ph.D., F.R.S. (British Museum (Natural History),

Zoological Museum, Tring, Herts, England).

Vice-President: Dr. James L. Peters (Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, U.S.A.).

Secretary: Mr. Francis Hemming, C.M.G., C.B.E. (London, England).

## B. The Members of the Commission

Class 1949

Senor Dr. Angel Cabrera (La Plata, Argentina).

Mr. Francis Hemming (London, England) (Secretary to the Commission).

Dr. Karl Jordan (British Museum (Natural History), Zoological Museum, Tring, Herts, England) (President of the Commission).

Dr. Th. Mortensen (Universitetets Zoologisk Museum, Copenhagen, Denmark).

Dr. Joseph Pearson (Tasmanian Museum, Hobart, Tasmania, Australia).

#### Class 1952

Senhor Dr. Afranio do AMARAL (S. Paulo, Brazil).

Professor J. Chester Bradley (Cornell University, Ithaca, N.Y., U.S.A.). Professor Lodovico di Caporiacco (University of Parma, Italy).

Professor J. R. Dymond (University of Toronto, Canada).

Dr. James L. Peters (Museum of Comparative Zoology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, U.S.A.) (Vice-President of the Commission).

Dr. Harold E. Vokes (United States Geological Survey, Washington, D.C., U.S.A.).

#### *Class* 1955

Professor Dr. Hilbrand Boschma (Rijksmuseum van Natuurlijke Historie, Leiden, The Netherlands).
Dr. William Thomas Calman (Tayport, Fife, Scotland).

Professor Teiso Esaki (Kyushu University, Fukuoka, Japan). Professor Béla Hankó (University of Debrecen, Hungary).

Dr. Tadeusz Jaczewski (Polish Zoological Museum, Warsaw, Poland).

Dr. Norman R. Stoll (Rockefeller Institute for Medical Research, Princeton, New Jersey, U.S.A.).

#### Alternate Members of the Commission at the Session held in Paris in 1948

Professor Enrique Beltrán (Instituto Mexicano de Recursos Naturales Renovables A.C., Mexico City, Mexico).

Dr. Edward Hindle (Zoological Society of London, London, England).

Dr. Arturo Ricardo Jorge (Museu Bocage, Lisbon, Portugal).
Professor Harold Kirby (University of California, Berkeley, California, U.S.A.).
Dr. Henning Lemche (Kgl. Veterinær- og Landbohøjskole, Zoologisk Laboratorium, Copenhagen, Denmark).
Professor Kamel Mansour (King Fouad University, Cairo, Egypt).
Professor Z. P. Metcalf (North Carolina State College of Agriculture and Engineering University of North Carolina Palaigh, North Carolina U.S.A.)

Engineering, University of North Carolina, Raleigh, North Carolina, U.S.A.). Mr. N. D. Riley (British Museum (Natural History), London, England). Professor Ragnar Spärck (Universitetets Zoologisk Museum, Copenhagen,

Denmark).

Professor Victor van Straelen (Institut Royal des Sciences Naturelles de

Belgique, Bruxelles, Belgium).
Professor Robert L. USINGER (University of California, Berkeley, California, U.S.A.).

# **OPINION 212**

DESIGNATION OF THE DATES TO BE ACCEPTED AS THE DATES OF PUBLICATION OF THE SEVERAL VOLUMES OF PALLAS (P.S.), "ZOOGRAPHIA ROSSO-ASIATICA"

RULING:—(1) The dates to be assigned to the several volumes of Pallas (P.S.), Zoographia rosso-asiatica are as follows: Volume 1, 1811; Volume 2, 1811; Volume 3, [1814]. (2) In view of (1) above, new names published in the foregoing work rank for purposes of priority as from the dates severally specified above. (3) The foregoing work with the ruling specified in (1) above is hereby placed on the Official List of Zoological Works Approved as Available in Zoological Nomenclature as Work No. 3.

#### I.—THE STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On 7th April 1934 the late Mr. W. L. Sclater, writing on behalf of the Committee of the British Ornithologists' Union dealing with the nomenclature of British birds, addressed an inquiry to the then Secretary of the International Commission (the late Dr. C. W. Stiles) as to the dates which should be accepted as those from which names published in the several volumes of Pallas's Zoographia rosso-asiatica ranked for purposes of priority.

2. In May 1934 this inquiry was brought to the notice of the International Commission by Dr. Stiles in Circular Letter 256.

In March 1935 this case was included in the Agenda then issued for the Session which the Commission was to hold at Lisbon later that year. When, however, the Commission assembled at Lisbon in September 1935, the Secretary was absent through ill-health and the documents relating to this case were not available. The Commission accordingly found itself unable to deal with the present application.

3. In October 1936, Mr. Francis Hemming was elected Secretary to the Commission on the retirement of Dr. Stiles, and in the following month (on 18th November) Mr. Sclater addressed to him a further letter on this subject. In his reply (dated 5th February 1937), Mr. Hemming expressed the view that the question at issue was one which could be settled only by obtaining an authoritative ruling from the International Commission, and he suggested therefore that the Commission should be asked to render an Opinion on this subject. In 1938 the documents relating to this and other current cases were transferred to Mr. Hemming's care, and on the re-organisation of the Secretariat then carried out, the two sets of documents relating to this case were brought together, being given the Registered Number Z.N.(S.)25. It had not been possible to advance the consideration of this case when in September 1939 the outbreak of war in Europe led to the evacuation of the records of the Commission from London to the country as a precaution against the risk of destruction through air raids. The Secretariat in London was re-opened in 1942, and steps were immediately taken to establish the Bulletin of Zoological Nomenclature as a means for bringing to the attention of zoologists applications submitted to the International Commission for decision. Work was at once started on outstanding applications with a view to arranging for their publication in the newly established Bulletin. The death of Mr. Sclater as the result of injuries received during an air raid on London made it necessary for the Secretary himself to decide how best this case should be brought before the International Commission. After consultation with Dr. Karl Jordan, then President of the Commission, Mr. Hemming decided that the best course would be to publish in the Bulletin the letter which he had received from Mr. Sclater in 1936, to which he added one paragraph (inserted as the concluding paragraph) from the earlier letter of 1934 which dealt with an

aspect of the problem not mentioned in the later letter. The application so settled was as follows:—

On the date as from which the names published in Pallas (P.S.), "Zoographia Rosso-Asiatica" are available nomenclatorially

#### By W. L. SCLATER, M.A.

The question of the date of publication of Pallas, Zoographia rosso-asiatica is one which has caused us a good deal of troubled discussion and I have been asked to inquire whether the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature would take the matter up and give a decision.

The facts are well known and are given in some detail in a short paper in the *Ibis* **1934**: 164 by Dr. C. D. Sherborn, a copy of which is attached hereto (see Annex).

The question really resolves itself into what constitutes publication. Some copies of Pallas are dated "1811", and there can be no doubt that the book was in the hands of some zoologists soon after that date, but owing to political troubles in Russia at that time and the Napoleonic invasion, the bulk of the edition was not issued till many years later. Most of the copies are dated "1831".

But from the point of view of the nomenclature of our British birds the matter is of considerable importance, as a number of new names were introduced in the work which, if dated as from 1811, would be valid, but, if dated as from 1827 or 1831, would be invalidated by other names introduced by authors whose work was published between 1811 and 1827.

Annex to application submitted by Mr. W. L. Sclater on the date of Pallas's "Zoographia Rosso-Asiatica"

# By the late C. D. SHERBORN, D.Sc.

In order to clear away the numerous misunderstandings surrounding the dates of this work, my friend Mr. Norman Kinnear has asked me to codify and publish the notes made by me over a period of forty-five years.

Pallas's work consisted of three volumes. There were two issues, which differ slightly in the title-pages. Some of these copies are dated:

Vol. 1. 1811; vol. 2. 1811; vol. 3. no date. Other copies, and these the most common, were dated: Vol. 1. 1831; vol. 2. 1831; vol. 3. 1831.

Of the former, I have known copies in the British Museum (Nat. Hist.), O. Salvin, A. Newton, G. M. Mathews, E. Eversmann, and other libraries. Of the latter numerous copies are known, and need not be detailed.

The work was known to many of the principal zoologists of Europe when it first appeared (see note to Cuvier no. 9), and the following notes will be of interest as proving the point:—

- 1. Rudolphi (Beitr. z. Anthrop. (Berlin), 1812, p. 70) refers to Pars Prima (1811), 568 pp.; Pars Secunda (1812), no pp. These he received after Pallas's death, which occurred on 8th September 1811, and, therefore, he may have received the Pars Secunda later than the Pars Prima. Rudolphi also refers in his Entoz. Syn. 1819, pp. 56 and 59, to Pallas, vol. 3, pp. 102 and 409, as "Petrop. 1813".
- 2. In *Isis* (Oken), 1819, *Litt. Anz.* p. 186, a note says the plates are being engraved under the direction of Tilesius, and that the first two volumes are printed off (Mamm. Birds, Reptiles, Fishes).
- 3. Tilesius, Add. Conch. ad Zoogr. Rosso-Asiat. in *Mém. Ac. Imp. Sci.* St. Pétersbourg, **8**, 1817—1818 (1822), read 1st November 1820, p. 293. The opening sentence of this paper leads one to infer that Pallas's work was then accessible. See entry under *Isis* (No. 2).
- 4. Eversmann (*Reise von Orenburg*, Berlin, 1823) refers on p. 117 to the *Zoographia* as "Petrop. 1811, 3 vols. 4to", and in his text quotes vols. 1, 2 and 3 (up to p. 31).
- 5. Lichtenstein (Abh. k. pr. Ak. Wiss. 1822—1823 (1825), p. 6) refers to Zoogr. 1, p. 117. In Ersch & Gruber, Allg. Ency., 19, 1829, p. 255, he refers to Zoogr. 3, p. 255.
- 6. Meyendorff (*Voy. d'Orenbourg*, **8**°, Paris, 1826, p. 381) says "Petrop. 1811, 3 vol. in 4to, ouvrage qui n'est pas encore assez connue".
- 7. Gloger (N. Acta Ac. Caes. 13(2) 1827, p. 484) quotes Zoogr. 1, 135 as a rare book.
- 8. Nitzsch. (Ersch & Gruber, Allg. Ency., 16, 1927, p. 152) quotes vol. 2.
- 9. Cuvier (*Règne Anim*. ed. **2**, ii, 1829, p. 163, and iii, 1829, p. 398) says "Ouvrage que l'on n'a pu rendre public parceque les cuivres en sont egarés. Neanmoins l'Academie de Pétersbourg a bien volu en accorder le texte à quelques naturalistes". In the *Hist. Poiss*. i. 1828, p. 200, he says; "n'a point encore été publié".

Further, in the *Hist. Poiss.*, Cuvier and Valenciennes in ii, 1828, p. 117, and iv, 1829, p. 152, quote the *Zoogr.* vol. iii, pp. 126 and 246.

- 10. Eschscholtz (Zool. Atlas, 3, 1829) quotes the Zoogr., 2, p. 362.
- 11. In Froriep, Notizen, 28, 1830, p. 151, there is a notice of vol. 3.
- 12. In *Rev. Ency.*, 49, March 1831, p. 726, is a note to say that the drawings and plates have been recovered from Leipzig by v. Behr (Baer) and presented to the Academy of St. Petersburg on 18th and 25th October 1830.

The Zoographia formed the subject of a paper by von Baer in 1831 (re-issued in 1832) in a thin quarto of 36 pp. published in Koenigsberg. From this I can only quote some essentials. Baer says:—The text of the Mammals and Birds was sent by Pallas in 1806. Printing began towards the end of 1807 under the eye of Tilesius, and these portions were completely printed just after Pallas's death. The printing of the Fishes was finished in the year 1814. In 1826 the Academy held a commission to put the three volumes on sale: "L'Académie s'est determinée à le mettre à vente". For all the elaborate details I must refer the reader to this pamphlet.

The Zoographia was also the subject of remarks by Strauch in 1873 (Mém. Ac. Imp. Sci. St. Pétersbourg (7) xxi. p. 7), who says the Herpetology was all printed by 1811, but plates were delayed for 20 years later. The work appeared in 1831 with new title-pages, and was put into the booksellers' hands.

Seebohm in 1882 wrote a note to "The Ibis", 1882, p. 425, but Alfred Newton in a letter to me of 7th March 1891, calls it an "extraordinary assertion", and says that Seebohm in "The Ibis", 1882, p. 611, was satisfied that he had been in error, and declared his former statement to be a "myth". Alfred Newton, who was most learned on the subject, wrote me four letters upon it between 1891 and 1906.

The general delay was caused by Pallas's obstinate determination to have his plates done by Geissler, the Leipzig engraver, as is stated in a note issued by the Academy of St. Petersburg, in 1826, p. 16.

From what has been quoted above it is quite clear that vols. 1 and 2 were available to the first zoologists of Europe in 1811 and vol. 3 in 1814, and these are the dates that I adopted in my *Index Animalium* and those which should be accepted.

Some prints from certain missing plates (unpublished) are said to exist in Berlin (where, also, are Pallas's types), as well as in St. Petersburg. The British Museum (Nat. Hist.), Rothschild, Tweeddale, Salvin, and Zoological Society's copies of the work seem to be all alike as to plates.

#### II.—THE SUBSEQUENT HISTORY OF THE CASE

- **4.** The application in regard to the present case was sent to the printer in September, 1944, but, owing to difficulties arising from paper rationing, shortage of labour at the printing works and similar causes, publication did not actually take place until February 1947 (*Bull. zool. Nomencl.* **1**: 198—200).
- **5.** As this case involved the problem of what constitutes "publication" for the purposes of the *Règles*, its further consideration was postponed until the meeting of the Commission in Paris in the following year when it had been arranged that the general problem involved should be brought forward for decision.

# III.—THE DECISION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION ON ZOOLOGICAL NOMENCLATURE

6. The present application was considered by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature at the Thirteenth Meeting of its Paris Session held at the Sorbonne in the Amphithéâtre Louis-Liard on Monday, 26th July 1948 at 1730 hours. This case was presented to the Commission by the Acting President (Mr. Francis Hemming), who recalled that, prior to the opening of the Paris Congress, there had existed no guiding principle by which the Commission could have considered the present application. During the Paris Congress, that difficulty. however, had been removed by the provisions which it had been agreed to recommend should be inserted in the Règles, (1) defining the meaning to be attached to the expression "divulgué dans une publication" as used in Article 25 (Paris Session, 7th Meeting, Conclusion 15) (1950, Bull. zool. Nomencl. 4:215-221), and (2) prescribing the method to be adopted in determining the date to be accepted as the date of publication for any given work (Paris Session, 7th Meeting, Conclusion 18) (1950, ibid. 4:223—225). The following is an extract from the Official Record of the Proceedings of the International Commission at the foregoing meeting, which sets out the decision reached by it in this case in the light of the decisions on the underlying questions of principle, on which (as explained above) decisions had been reached earlier during the Paris Congress (Paris Session, 13th Meeting, Conclusion 39) (1950, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 4:402—403):—

### THE COMMISSION agreed:—

(1) that under the provisions added to the *Règles* during the present Congress the dates to be assigned to the several volumes of Pallas (P.S.), *Zoographia rosso-asiatica* were:—

Volume 1 1811 Volume 2 1811 Volume 3 [1814];

- (2) that, in view of (1) above, new names published in the foregoing work rank for purposes of priority as from the dates severally specified above;
- (3) to render an *Opinion* recording the decisions specified in (1) and (2) above.
- 7. At its meeting held at Copenhagen in August 1953, the Fourteenth International Congress of Zoology decided to insert a provision in the Règles establishing an "Official List" to be styled the Official List of Zoological Works Approved as Available in Zoological Nomenclature and directing the insertion therein of the title of any work which the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature might declare to be an available work, together with any supplementary decisions which the International Commission might take in regard to any aspect of such a work (1953, Copenhagen Decisions zool. Nomencl.: 24). Since the foregoing provision applies to past, as well as to future, decisions by the International Commission in cases of this kind, the opportunity presented by the preparation of the present Opinion has been taken to record the insertion in the foregoing Official List of the title of Pallas's Zoographia rosso-asiatica, together with particulars of the decision in regard thereto set out in the present Opinion.

- 8. The decision taken in the present case was reported to, and approved by, the Section on Nomenclature of the Thirteenth International Congress of Zoology, Paris, 1948, at its Fifth Meeting held on Monday, 26th July 1948 (1950, *Bull. zool. Nomencl.* 5:108).
- 9. The Ruling given in the present *Opinion* was concurred in by the sixteen (16) Commissioners and Alternate Commissioners present at the Paris Session of the International Commission, namely:—

Beltrán vice Cabrera; Boschma; Bradley; di Caporiacco; Hemming; Hindle vice Jordan; Jorge vice do Amaral; Kirby vice Stoll; Lemche vice Dymond; Mansour vice Hankó; Metcalf vice Peters; Riley vice Dalman; Rode; Spärck vice Mortensen; van Straelen vice Richter; Usinger vice Vokes.

- 10. The Ruling given in the present *Opinion* was dissented from by no Commissioner or Alternate Commissioner present at the Paris Session.
- 11. The prescribed procedures were duly complied with by the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature in dealing with the present case, and the present *Opinion* is accordingly hereby rendered in the name of the said International Commission by the under-signed Francis Hemming, Secretary to the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature, in virtue of all and every the powers conferred upon him in that behalf.
- 12. The present *Opinion* shall be known as *Opinion* Two Hundred and Twelve (212) of the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature.

DONE in London, this Twenty-Fifth day of November, Nineteen Hundred and Fifty-Three.

Secretary to the International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature

#### FRANCIS HEMMING